## REMARKS

Applicants have incorporated the subject matter of claim 12 into claim 11 and subsequently cancelled claim 12. As a result, claims 11 and 13-20 are pending in the application. Claims 11-20 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 112, second paragraph, as being indefinite for failing to particularly point out and distinctly claim the subject matter which Applicants regard as the invention. Additionally, claims 11-20 would be allowable if rewritten or amended to overcome the foregoing rejection under § 112, second paragraph.

Applicants respectfully request reconsideration of the present application in view of the foregoing amendments and following remarks.

## Claims 11-20 and 35 U.S.C. § 112, Second Paragraph

The rejection of claims 11-20 under 35 U.S.C. § 112, second paragraph, is respectfully traversed. Specifically, the Office suggests that the elements of groups I, III and VI of the periodic table be recited in the claims. Moreover, the Office suggests that the claims recite an electrolysis bath comprising a group I element compound and a group VI element compound in addition to the at least one group III element compound.

Applicants have amended the claims as suggested by the Office. As a result, Applicants respectfully request that the present rejection be withdrawn.

## CONCLUSION

In view of the foregoing, an allowance of the claims is respectfully solicited. The Examiner is respectfully invited to contact J. Clinton Wimbish at 704.338.5021 to discuss any matter related to the present application.

Respectfully submitted,

10/12/09

J. Clinton Wimbish

KILPATRICK STOCKTON LLP